

10-25-01

STATE OF FLORIDA
COMMISSION ON HUMAN RELATIONS

FILED
02 JUN -4 AM 9:47
DIVISION OF ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS

AT

KATRINA SHANNON,

EEOC Case No. 15DA00795

Petitioner,

FCHR Case No. 20-03573

v.

DOAH Case No. 01-2079

THE BOWLES GROUP, INC.,

FCHR Order No. 02-022

Respondent.

SDC-CWS

FINAL ORDER DISMISSING REQUEST FOR
RELIEF FROM AN UNLAWFUL EMPLOYMENT PRACTICE

Preliminary Matters

Petitioner Katrina Shannon filed a complaint of discrimination pursuant to the Florida Civil Rights Act of 1992, Sections 760.01 - 760.11, Florida Statutes (1999), alleging that Respondent The Bowles Group, Inc., committed an unlawful employment practice on the basis of Petitioner's race (Black) when it terminated her from her position as Store Manager.

Petitioner requested an administrative hearing, and the case was transmitted to the Division of Administrative Hearings for the conduct of a formal proceeding.

An evidentiary hearing was held on August 23, 2001, in Pensacola, Florida, before Administrative Law Judge Diane Cleavinger.

Judge Cleavinger issued a Recommended Order of dismissal, dated October 25, 2001.

The Commission panel designated below considered the record of this matter and determined the action to be taken on the Recommended Order.

Findings of Fact

We find the Administrative Law Judge's findings of fact to be supported by competent substantial evidence.

We adopt the Administrative Law Judge's findings of fact.

Conclusions of Law

We find the Administrative Law Judge's application of the law to the facts to result in a correct disposition of the matter.

We note that the Administrative Law Judge concludes that as an element of establishing a prima facie case of discrimination a causal connection must be shown between the act complained of and the protected class. See, Recommended Order, ¶ 63.

We conclude this to be error, albeit harmless error in this instance.

The Commission has indicated that this element is actually what a Petitioner is attempting to show by establishing a prima facie case of discrimination, and that this should not, itself, be an element of the test for a prima facie case. See, Baxla v. Fleetwood Enterprises, Inc., d/b/a Fleetwood Homes of Florida, Inc., 20 F.A.L.R. 2583, at 2585 (FCHR 1998), citing Pugh v. Walt Disney World, 18 F.A.L.R. 1971, at 1972 (FCHR 1995), and Martinez v. Orange County Fleet Manager, 21 F.A.L.R. 163, at 164 (FCHR 1997).

In modifying the conclusions of law of the Administrative Law Judge as explained, supra, we find: (1) that the conclusion of law being modified is a conclusion of law over which the Commission has substantive jurisdiction, namely a conclusion of law stating what must be demonstrated to establish a prima facie case of unlawful discrimination under the Florida Civil Rights Act of 1992; (2) that the reason the modification is being made by the Commission is that the conclusion of law as stated runs contrary to previous Commission decisions on the issue; and (3) that in making this modification the conclusion of law we are substituting is as or more reasonable than the conclusion of law which has been rejected. See, Section 120.57(1)(1), Florida Statutes (2001).

With the modification indicated, we adopt the Administrative Law Judge's conclusions of law.

Exceptions

Neither party filed exceptions to the Administrative Law Judge's recommended order.

Dismissal

The Request for Relief and Complaint of Discrimination are DISMISSED with prejudice.

The parties have the right to seek judicial review of this Order. The Commission and the appropriate District Court of Appeal must receive notice of appeal within 30 days of the date this Order is filed with the Clerk of the Commission. Explanation of the right to appeal is found in Section 120.68, Florida Statutes, and in the Florida Rules of Appellate Procedure 9.110.

DONE AND ORDERED this 3rd day of JUNE, 2002.
FOR THE FLORIDA COMMISSION ON HUMAN RELATIONS:

Commissioner Keith Roberts, Panel Chairperson;
Commissioner Leonie Hermantin; and
Commissioner P.C. Wu

FILED
02 JUN -4 AM 9:47
DIVISION
ADMINISTRATIVE
HEARINGS

Filed this 3rd day of JUNE, 2002,
in Tallahassee, Florida.

Violet Crawford

Violet Crawford, Clerk
Commission on Human Relations
2009 Apalachee Parkway, Suite 100
Tallahassee, FL 32301
(850) 488-7082

NOTICE TO COMPLAINANT / PETITIONER

As your complaint was filed under Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, which is enforced by the U.S. Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC), you have the right to request EEOC to review this Commission's final agency action. To secure a "substantial weight review" by EEOC, you must request it in writing within 15 days of your receipt of this Order. Send your request to Miami District Office (EEOC), One Biscayne Tower, 2 South Biscayne Blvd., Suite 2700, 27th Floor, Miami, FL 33131.

Copies furnished to:

Katrina Shannon
2805 East Strong Street
Pensacola, FL 32503

Deborah E. Frimmel, Esq.
Jackson, Lewis, Schnitzler and Krupman
P.O. Box 3389
Orlando, FL 32802-3389

Diane Cleavinger, Administrative Law Judge, DOAH

James Mallue, Legal Advisor for Commission Panel